***REPORT***

1. **Title of the Project:**

|  |
| --- |
| Tempus “Strategic Management of Higher Education Institutions Based on Integrated Quality Assurance System- SHEQA” SMRG\_ 511262\_2010 |

1. **WP 8.1 :**

|  |
| --- |
| Quality monitoring |

1. **Deliverable:**

|  |
| --- |
| Two experts from EU partner, UCC, to travel to visit all BiH universities in one week, at minimum in years 2 and 3 of the project, along with a visit to the Higher Education Agency and also enaging with relevant ministries for education. The objective of the visit to each university and Ministry is:   1. To discuss the progress made by each University on the implementation of the use of the Optima software for the gathering and analysis of data for generation of KPIs. 2. To discuss the progress made by each University on the implementation of the use of the Optima software for the generation of the Register of study programmes. 3. To consider any difficulties that any of the BiH partners might be experiencing and to consider possible solutions. 4. To consider the generation of a Register of Study Programmes to be held at both institutional and national levels and to include all programmes, both accredited and non-accredited. 5. To consider the dissemination activities planned. 6. To consider the action plan developed by each university for the sustainability of the activities subsequent to the conclusion of the project. |

1. **Final Report following conference in Mostar 10/11 October 2013:**

|  |
| --- |
| This report is the final report on the quality monitoring of the Tempus SHEQA project. This report provides a complete report on the outcomes of the visit to all BiH public universities in June 2013, where the universities demonstrated the progress made to date, and is updated with additional information received at the dissemination conference in Mostar in October 2013. All universities were provided with an opportunity to suggest amendments/additions to this report before its finalization. Evidence of activity was provided both during the June visit and at the final conference held in Mostar. |

1. **Place:**

|  |
| --- |
| University of Mostar , as part of the dissemination conference |

1. **Objective:**

|  |
| --- |
| The objectives of each visit to each university, the relevant Ministries and the Higher Education Agency were:   1. To meet with relevant staff, including a member of the senior management team in the case of universities, and to discuss the progress made by each University on the implementation of the use of the Optima software for the gathering and analysis of data for generation of the common set of agreed KPIs, and the generation of the register of study programmes in each institution.. 2. To discuss progress made by the universities in generating a set of additional KPIs appropriate for the specific needs of the university in support of its strategic objectives and its operational plan. 3. To consider any difficulties that any of the BiH partners might be experiencing in the use of the software or any proposals for amendments to the common set of KPIs agreed or to the software. 4. To consider the generation of a Register of Study Programmes to be held at national level and to include all programmes, both accredited and non-accredited. 5. To consider the dissemination activities undertaken by each institution. 6. To consider the links to the relevant ministries. 7. To consider the action plan for the sustainability of the software and the maintenance of accurate data in each institution after the conclusion of the Tempus SHEQA project. |

1. **Outcomes, conclusions and recommendations:**

**Outcomes of quality monitoring visit held in June 2013 updated following additional information received on 10/11 October 2013**:

***Introduction***

The visiting team from UCC, accompanied by a representative of Wus-Austria, travelled to each public university, the Higher Education Agency (HEA) and Ministries, met with representatives of universities and ministries and discussed the implementation of the KPIs, the use of the software provided by the project to collect and analyze data; the use of the software to generate the Register of Study Programmes in each University and the ability of the universities to deliver a list of the study programmes offered by the University in preparation for the development of a national Register of Study Programmes. Below is a brief summary of the findings for each visit and the subsequent follow-up with conclusions for each, followed by overall conclusions for the site visits and recommendations to all university partners and the HEA. Detailed reports are contained in the Annexes to this document.

**University of Mostar/ Ministry of Education, West Herzegovina Canton**

In attendance at meeting held in June 2013:

**University of Mostar:**

Professor Ivana Zovko, International Relations Coordinator

Prof. Dr. Snježana Rezić, Tempus SHEQA coordinator

Prof. Dr. Dražena Gašpar

Prof. Dr. Vojo Višekruna, Vice-Rector for Teaching and Education

Marko Odak

**Ministry of Education, West Herzegovina Canton:** Zelimir Bakula

**UCC**: Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director of Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria**: MScDino Mujkić, Regional Manager

The meeting was held in the rectorate of the university. The University had submitted a written report on the progress to date on the use and implementation of the data and the software commissioned prior to the site visit.

Prof Rezić commenced the report by making a comprehensive presentation on the current situation in the University of Mostar, including a very detailed presentation of the softwares for the collection and analysis of KPIs and also for the Register of Study Programmes. It was confirmed that the University is very committed to the collection and use of KPIs in strategic management and very significant work has been done to ensure accurate data is entered and stored. The University senior management and Senate confirmed their commitment to continuing and further developing the work on KPIs, data collection and its use in strategic planning and monitoring of implementation of plans, together with the maintenance of a register of study programmes easily accessible to the public, including potential students and other key stakeholders. Hard copies of the complete register of study programmes and the student prospectus were provided to the visiting team.

In summary it is evident that the University has made excellent progress in implementing in full the objectives of the project and in delivering the anticipated outcomes. As an update provided in October 2013 the university provided a detailed development report which includes the approach adopted to ensure sustainability beyond the lifetime of the project and confirmed that the link for the University’s Register of Study Programmes has been sent to HEA for uploading to the Agency’s web site.

A detailed report on the progress made at the formal conclusion of the project is given in Annex 1 (attached).

**University of Džemal Bijedić Mostar**

In attendance at meeting held in June 2013:

**University of Džemal Bijedić Mostar:**

Professor Dr. Sead Pašić, Rector (14.00 – 14.30)

Alim Abazovic, QA cordinator

Larisa Tipura, faculty staff member, Faculty of Information Technology

**UCC**: Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria**: MScDino Mujkić, Regional Manager

Apologies:

**University of Džemal Bijedić Mostar**: Professor Dr Nina Bijedić, Vice-Rector for International Relations.

The meeting commenced with a discussion with the Rector of the university on the advantages and potential for the university of achieving the objectives of the project. The Rector confirmed he had been involved at the commencement of the project but had little involvement over the past three years due to other commitments. As the Rector, newly appointed, he is firmly committed to implementing the project and expressed a clear view on the need for both measurement and analysis of KPIs and completing a register of study programmes at university level for the future development and management of the university. The university is facing very significant financial and human resource difficulties at the present time and had not yet been able to implement the objectives of the project by June 2013. The KPI software has been installed on the university server and some KPIs are being monitored. The software for the Register of Study Programmes had not yet been installed and, while training of some staff in its use has taken place in February 2013, the work on completing the Register has not yet begun.

An update was provided to the October meeting which confirmed that the University has made very significant progress in developing the register and entering data during the summer months. The Rector has established a dedicated working group to lead on the work, internal trainings and workshops have taken place over the summer months and many staff are now trained in the use of the software both for the Register of Study Programmes and also the measurement of KPIs. The relevant software has been installed and data entered. The Register of study programmes is available on the public web site of the University. In addition the university is using the outcomes of the projects to advance the process of full integration within the university and confirmed its commitment to the full implementation of the objectives of the project as soon as possible within the next few months.

A detailed report on the progress on implementation to date is given in Annex 2 (attached).

**University of Sarajevo**

In attendance at meeting held in June 2013:

14.00 Rector Prof. Dr. Muharem Avdispahić

**University of Sarajevo**

Prof. Dr. Faruk Mekić, Vice-Rector responsible for QA

Prof. Dr. Senad Burak, Director of UTIC

MSc. Dušanka Bošković, Faculty of Electrical Engineering, member of SHEQA Team

MSc. Zenan Šabanac, Faculty of Science, SHEQA contact person on behalf of UNSA

**UCC**: Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria**:

MSc Almir Kovačević, Executive Director

MScDino Mujkić, Regional Manager

The Rector welcomed the visiting team to the University and confirmed his views on the value of the objectives of the SHEQA project to the University.

The University of Sarajevo is a large institution, not yet integrated. It has not yet commenced the population of the softwares with the KPI and study programmes data. The software has been installed and some piloting has taken place with identification of some issues / difficulties for the university. The University demonstrated elements of the information system within the university and expressed confidence that transfer of data from the central information system to the SHEQA software can be undertaken. The centre for Information management within the university will assist with this.

No representatives of the University of Sarajevo attended the meeting held in October 2013 in Mostar. No update as provided to the report generated after the June meeting.

A detailed report on the progress to date and the outcome of the meeting is given in Annex 3 (attached).

**Ministry of Education and Science - Canton Sarajevo**

The representatives of the Ministry sent apologies as they were unable to attend due to other commitments.

**University of East Sarajevo**

In attendance at the meeting held in June 2013:

**University of East Sarajevo:**

Dr. Dejan Bokonjić, Vice Rector

Nenad Marković, Quality Assurance Officer

**UCC**: Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria:** MSc Almir Kovačević, Executive Director

The visiting team was welcomed to the university by the Vice-Rector. A detailed and comprehensive presentation was made on the implementation of the KPI and Register of Study Programmes softwares. The University is very well advanced in this exercise of implementation with engagement across the university. The University had some difficulties with some aspects of the software and will be considering solutions to these with the company supplying the software. Both softwares are populated and the university is using information and analysis from both for annual reporting and management decisions. The university senior management is very committed to the continued development of such management tools and to the continued use of these tools post the conclusion of the SHEQA project in October 2013.

The follow-up report made in Mostar in October provided evidence that the Register of study programmes is now available on the public web site of the university and the relevant link has been made available to the HEA. Almost all study programmes with details are on the system and the university is committed to the completion of this work by the end of November 2013. All translation issues have been resolved satisfactorily by the company providing the software. The university expressed its satisfaction with the project and the tolls provided to assist the university in its development.

A detailed report on the progress to date and the outcome of the meeting is given in Annex 4 (attached).

**University of Zenica**

In attendance:

**University of Zenica**

Professor Dr. Darko Petkovic, Vice Rector for Quality Assurance and International Cooperation

Mr. Sc. Ibrahim Plančić, Quality Assurance Officer

Assistant Prof. Dr. Malik Cabaravdic

**UCC**:

Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director Quality Promotion

Fiona Crozier, Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria**: MScDino Mujkić, Regional Manager

The Vice-Rector welcomed the visiting team to the University. A detailed and comprehensive presentation covering both the university context, population and use of the KPI and Register of Study Programmes software was made. The use of KPIs in strategic management is fully integrated into the university’s systems with annual reports to the University Board, the University Steering Board and the Senate all being based on data and graphics from the KPI software. The University is fully integrated and this has facilitated the population of both pieces of software with accurate data and the acceptance of this approach within the university. Along with the University of East Sarajevo the University of Zenica has engaged with a benchmarking exercise using the KPI data. Implementation has been very successful in Zenica.

As part of the follow-up report the university confirmed the use of the tools developed and the information derived therefrom in the planning and management of university activities. A detailed development plan was provided by the university. It was very evident that the delivery of the outcomes of the project is fully embedded within the university and is a model for others to follow.

A detailed report on the progress to date and the outcome of the meeting is given in Annex 5 (attached).

**Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport - Zenica-Doboj Canton**

The representative of the Ministry sent apologies as she was absent from the office on the day of the site visit in June.

**University of Tuzla**

In attendance:

**University of Tuzla**

Boris Ćurković, Chief of Cabinet, Rectorate

Almir Žigić, QA Officer

Denis Čeke, QA officer

**UCC**:

Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director Quality Promotion

Fiona Crozier, Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria**: MScDino Mujkić, Regional Manager.

Apologies:

Mensura Aščerić (Vice-Rector for International Cooperation)

The visiting team was welcomed to the University by the representative of the rectorate. A detailed and comprehensive presentation of the SHEQA software for both KPI collection and analysis and the Register of Study Programmes was made. The Unviersity is well advanced in the use of both softwares. Once a technical difficulty with the University website has been resolved (anticipated by mid-July) the Register of study programmes will be made publicly available and a link provided to the ministry and also the HEA. The University expressed its total commitment to the objectives and full implementation of the activities planned and has every intention of continuing to use the methodology post the conclusion of the project. The tools are found to be extremely useful for the management of the university’s strategic aims and targets, and reports are made annually to Senate and University Steering Board.

During the follow-up meeting held in Mostar the other partners expressed their very real appreciation to the staff of the University of Tuzla for their engagement with the company providing the software and the very real help the comments and suggestions made by Tuzla were to the enhancement and improvement of the software. The efforts of the University of Tuzla ensured that the other universities were able to benefit from their expertise and the developments in the software that occurred as a result. The excellence of the relationship developed between the relevant staff of Tuzla and the software company has added great value to the project in terms of the improvements made to the software.

The University expressed its satisfaction with the project and its commitment to continue to use the tools developed post the end of the project for university strategic planning and management. The university has fully implemented the use of both pieces of software. Public access is provided to the relevant elements of the Register of Study Programmes, in a specific customized manner. The University also expressed its gratitude that it was able to contribute significantly to the ultimate success of the project. The University plans to continue and expand its use of the software and to continue to engage with the software providers and all partners.

A detailed report on the progress to date and the outcome of the meeting is given in Annex 6 (attached).

**University of Banja Luka & Ministry of Education and Culture – Republic of Srpska**

In attendance

**University of Banja Luka:**

Prof. Dr. Simo Jokanovic, Vice -Rector

Ozren Trišić, University QA coordinator

Miroslav Dragić, former University QA coordinator

Goran Janjić, Faculty of Mechanical Engineering, QA coordinator

Dragan Gligorić, Faculty of Economics, QA coordinator

Branislav Jovković, ICT center

Aleksandav Gacina,

**Ministry of Education and Culture of Republic of Srpska**:

Vlado Davidović

Čedna Sobot

**UCC**:

Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director Quality Promotion

Fiona Crozier, Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria**: MSc Almir Kovačević, Executive Director

The visiting team was welcomed to the university by the Vice-Rector. A very detailed presentation on both the gathering of data on KPIs and the Register of Study Programmes was made. The University is very committed to the use of these tools and welcomed the commitment of the ministry to publishing information on its web site and to working with the University to develop this work further. The population of the Register of Study Programmes is not yet complete but will be by September 2013. Dissemination events have taken place and will continue in the autumn 2013. The University is very committed and has invested a lot of resources to the continuation of use of the tools post the conclusion of the SHEQA project.

At the meeting in Mostar the University presented its work again and confirmed it has completed the population of the Register with relevant data and is committed to the continuation of this work with updates as appropriate. Satisfaction was expressed with the tools provided by the project and the work of the software company and colleagues in other universities in resolving issues that had arisen.

A detailed report on the progress to date and the outcome of the meeting is given in Annex 7 (attached).

**Higher Education Agency (HEA)**

In attendance:

**HEA:**

Velimir Jukic, Deputy Director

Benjamin Muhamedbegović, Assistant Director for Quality Assurance

Marina Matošević

Sanela Pašić Delahmetovic

Nerma Kadic

**UCC**:

Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director, Quality Promotion

Ms. Fiona Crozier, Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria:** MSc Almir Kovačević, Executive Director

The visiting team was welcomed to the HEA by the Deputy Director, Velimir Jukic. Following a brief presentation on the current status of the web site of the HEA and the information contained therein, discussions centered on the plans for the upgrading of the web site to include information on the status of accreditation of HEIs in BiH. The HEA has received links from 4 of the 8 universities in the SHEQA consortium to their registers of study programmes and will proceed to publish these and any others received over the next few weeks as soon as the web site is upgraded to facilitate this.

Discussions also took place on the importance of the role of the HEA as a provider of reliable information to the public. The accuracy of the data provided on study programmes is the responsibility of each university while the accuracy of the data on the accreditation status of all HEIs in BiH is the responsibility of the HEA.

The HEA plans to complete the upgrading of the web site by 20 July 2013 and to formally launch the new web site and its information in the autumn – probably at the dissemination conference for the SHEQA project in October.

At the meeting in Mostar the Assistant Director confirmed that the links to the universities Registers of Study Programmes are available on the Agency web site. However concern was expressed that the link is not very visible and it is possible that the relevant information may not be easily accessible to potential learners and other key stakeholders. The importance of the role of the national agency in promoting the availability of information on study programmes in all public universities in BiH and the oversight role that the Agency has was stressed. As a central resource for such information and to aid the recognition of the role of the national agency in quality assurance of higher education in BiH the easy accessibility of all relevant information is very important. Hopes were expressed that the Agency would continue to work towards the achievement of these objectives.

A detailed report on the progress to date and the outcome of the meeting is given in Annex 8 (attached).

**University of Bihać**

In attendance:

**University of Bihac:**

Mirzet Grozdanić, QA Manager

Dzalila Osmanović, International Relations Officer

Jasmina Ibrahimpašić

Adnan Ramakić

**UCC**:

Dr. Norma Ryan, former Director Quality Promotion

Fiona Crozier, Director, Quality Promotion

**Wus-Austria**: MSc Almir Kovačević, Executive Director

The University of Bihac has not yet installed either the software for the collection and analysis of key performance indicators or that for the compilation of the Register of Study Programmes. There has been no work on the testing of the softwares. The University still has not purchased servers to put the software on and indicated that the servers already located within the University would not have sufficient spare space to enable it to proceed. Thus there has not been any work done as yet with repect to the implementation of the SHEQA objectives.

At the meeting in Mostar the representative of the university confirmed that a server has been acquired for the dedicated hosting of the software and that the software has been uploaded onto the server. The university has made significant progress in uploading data and expressed its commitment to the achievement of the objectives of the SHEQA project.

A detailed report on the progress to date and the outcome of the meeting is given in Annex 9 (attached).

**Conclusions**:

Five of the eight public universities (Banja Luka, East Sarajevo, Sveuciliste u Mostaru, Tuzla and Zenica) in BiH have made excellent progress in the installation, piloting and use of the SHEQA software for collection and analysis of KPIs and the Register of Study Programmes. These universities evidenced their commitment to the continued use of the tools developed post the conclusion of the SHEQA project. All expressed firm commitment and appreciation of the benefits and advantages of these tools for the strategic management of the universities as well as the added advantage to the public of the Register of Study Programmes.

Two of the universities (Bihac and Džemal Bijedić Mostar) have made very real progress over the summer months and demonstrated evidence of significant advancement in the installation and uploading of data to the software. Both expressed commitment to delivery of the objectives of the project within the next few months. While neither of them have completed the Register of Study Programmes or the full collection of KPIs with a view to the use of the information in strategic planning and development, both expressed their gratitude to the project partners for the support and are committed to full use of the tools in future planning for development of the universities.

The University of Sarajevo has not commenced the work in any significant manner on nor has it implemented the installation and population of the SHEQA software. Various reasons for this were provided to the visiting team, and does not necessarily imply that there is no data collection or analysis in the university. However the university has not to date (October 2013) delivered on the implementation of the SHEQA project objectives with respect to both collection and analysis of KPIs and Register of Study Programmes.

The Higher Education Agency has updated its web site and has published links to all the Registers of Study Programmes currently available. The Agency expressed its full commitment to assist the universities in the advertising the study programmes of each university and to making information available to the general public as well as other stakeholders. It was noted that the responsibility for accuracy of data published rests with the individual universities. More can be done in this regard and the HEA expressed its commitment to its support of the work of the universities.

The representatives of Ministries with whom the visiting team met were very committed to the dissemination of information to the public, to the use of KPIs in the future as a tool for assessing the performance of universities and for facilitating benchmarking exercises.

**Recommendations following June visit to all public universities in BiH**:

1. That all universities who have not yet completed the installation and populating of the software for the Register of Study Programmes seek to do so as soon as possible and no later than the end of September 2013 if possible.
2. That all institutions liaise with the University of Mostar re any remaining difficulties with the software, and especially the translation issues that seem to be present. The University of Mostar will then liaise with the company who provided and is supporting the software.
3. That all ministries provide a link to the Register of Study Programmes on the web site of the universities they are responsible for. Ideally links should be provided to all universities but this may not be possible.
4. That the HEA update the Agency web site as soon as possible to provide access to the links on university pages concerning the register of study programmes and the accreditation status of universities.

**Acknowledgements**

The team from UCC wishes to express its appreciation of the welcome and hospitality shown by all institutions visited.

In particular the members of the team from UCC wishes to express its appreciation and gratitude to the staff of Wus-Austria, and especially to Dino Mujkić and Almir Kovačević, for the excellence of the logistical arrangements (transport, accommodation) and the facilitation of the visit to BiH which enabled the UCC team to concentrate on the objectives of the visit.

**Annex 1**

**UNIVERSITY OF MOSTAR**

**Report on implementation of KPI and Register of study programmes**

**Key performance indicators**

Quality Assurance System of the University of Mostar was established in 2007 in the same form as it is today. Senate of the University of Mostar adopted all the documents necessary for functioning of the quality assurance system at the beginning of 2008.

* **Statement on the University of Mostar quality policy**
* **Strategy of quality assurance and improvement**
* **Rulebook on structure and functioning of the system for quality assurance and improvement**
* **Guidelines for self-analysis of studies**
* **Guidelines for making self-evaluation**
* **Guidebook on quality assurance**
* **Quality indicators**

Set of key performance indicators at the University level was defined in the framework of these documents. That set served to the University management for analysis of the state at the institution and making of strategic decisions.

After defining set of key performance indicators in the framework of SHEQA project the Quality Assurance Board accepted the new set of indicators which will be monitored at the University level. The University management was introduced with the set of key performance indicators as well as with significance of their monitoring for strategic management of the institution.

Workshop about using the software for monitoring KPIs at the University level was organized after development of the software. Two representatives of every University faculty (quality assurance coordinator and information system coordinator) participated in the workshop and went through training for using KPI software.

During the training representatives of the faculties were introduced to the functioning of the software, entering data and way of presenting data to the management of the particular faculty and University.

Comparing the existing quality assurance indicators and set of key performance indicators defined through SHEQA project it was concluded that some indicators had not been monitored at the University of Mostar so far and that every faculty should collect and enter those data in the software by the end of academic year 2012/2013 (publishing activity, published papers, etc.). Indicators which have been monitored through the University information system will be automatically uploaded into the KPI software. Every faculty has a person in charge of software (ISS coordinator) who will coordinate data entry for the faculty. Quality assurance coordinator is in charge of coordinating work between faculties, analysis and presentation of results at the University level through Quality Assurance Board and University management.

At this time (June 2013) 80% of data for monitoring key performance indicators was entered at the University of Mostar. Data refer to the academic years 2011/2012 and 2012/2013.

**Register of study programmes**

The Register of study programmes was presented to all members of the University of Mostar. Representatives of all sections of the University participated in the training on the use of the software. The methodology of the approach to the delivery of the Register of Study Programmes at the University is identical as to that used for collection and analysis of KPI.

All data related to the register of study programmes will be entered by the end of the academic year 2012/2013.

So far basic data about study programmes conducted at the University of Mostar has been entered. Entering of data on courses of certain study programmes and data about teachers are being entered at the moment and will continue to be updated as appropriate. The Link for the Register of Study Programmes has been approved by the senior university management for sending to the HEA and publication on the HEA web site.

**Report from meeting held Monday 24 June 2013**

**Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)**

As indicated above work on gathering data on KPIs commenced in 2004 and the quality assurance system, as it is today, was developed in 2007. The strategy was adopted by the Senate of the university, together with a Rule Book and a reference guide to self-evaluation. Initially data was collected manually and then funding was received from Wus-Austria to develop an information system allowing for automated collection of data on students, professors, student services administration, human resources, finance, etc.

The quality assurance administration has access to all data in the system, which is very detailed and comprehensive. The University provided a demonstration of the system during the meeting.

The Vice-Rector for Teaching has been working for long period in all aspects of teaching process and students and has spent significant time gathering data relating to students and programmes, requesting and receiving information from faculties. Reports have been made to the Rector, to senior management and to the Senate of the university. These reports not only contained data but also an analysis of the data. The Tempus SHEQA project has facilitated the collection and sorting of data in an information system and this has proved very beneficial to the university, with all information available to senior management and Senate, thus facilitating strategic planning and management. Accuracy of data can be a cause for concern and every effort is made to ensure its correctness.

The University of Mostar has a strategic development plan since 2011, with clearly defined aims and objectives, and has defined indicators to assist in the monitoring of the implementation of the plan. The University is committed to continuing this work subsequent to the conclusion of the SHEQA project and will use the software acquired from the project to enable the monitoring.

The University has an information system of which the software for the collection and analysis of KPIs is one component. Each faculty has a staff member dedicated to the support of the project and its aims, and this will continue after the conclusion of the project. The Senate has appointed a team of five staff to oversee the management of the information system. The company who provided the software has committed to continue its support.

**Register of study programmes**

Background was provided on the implementation of the project in the university and the development of the aims and goals. All faculties have committed to publishing on the university web site all study programmes offered and this has been in place since 2007. The University wishes to unify all information and procedures to ensure a coherent operation across all faculties in the development and delivery of study programmes. Beginning in 2004 the university collected data and published an ECTS guide in both Croatian and English on the university web site. The guide was published in pdf format which made it difficult to search and find information easily within it. Thus the University took the lead in developing the application for the SHEQA project in order to improve what it saw as needing to be done.

The data entry etc is now 80% completed it is hoped this will be finished by the end of September 2013. The Senate will then be asked for permission to publish the Register on the web site to ensure access by the public to all the information. The university has 109 study programmes and has found the software to be very comprehensive and suitable for the purpose.

The Ministry of Education in West Herzegovina Canton is committed to the project and has been involved since the beginning. The Ministry is firmly of the view that availability of this data to students and prospective students is very important and should include information on careers and future employment opportunities arising from programmes. The Ministry is committed to providing a link to the university web site to this information. A concern was expressed, and shared, concerning the accuracy of the data published and the responsibility for ensuring its correctness resting with the university. The University assured everyone that data is entered only on the basis of evidence provided, for example, publications.

**Dissemination**

The university held a conference at the end of the first year of the project which was open to the public and external stakeholders as well as to university staff and students. Another conference is planned for the autumn to be held approximately one month prior to the end of the SHEQA project. Planning for this event is well underway.

The university is also anxious that the Higher Education Agency will publish a link to the University web site where the register of study programmes will be. The university also plans to ask all key stakeholders to publish the link, when available, to aid in the dissemination of the information.

**Annex 2**

**Report on meeting with University of Džemal Bijedić Mostar**

The meeting commenced with an informal discussion with the Rector on the value and potential benefits of the project to the university.

The meeting continued with the Quality Assurance coordinator and a faculty staff member from the Faculty of Information Technology.

All expressed their commitment to use the software for the collection and analysis of KPIs and the Register of Study Programmes after the conclusion of the project. The advantages to the university for achieving both objectives of the project are clearly acknowledged and understood by the University.

**Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)**

The software is installed at the university. 15 KPIs are being monitored for use by the university in strategic planning and management. Some indicators are unclear to the university and there is uncertainty as to precisely what is meant by them. The university has also found some bugs in the software. The representatives indicated that they had communicated these to the company who provided the software and hoped they would be resolved soon.

The implementation of the strategic plan is under discussion at the University. The university has significant financial issues at the moment and is uncertain if resources can be allocated to this project. A lot of data has been collected and is being used by management in decision-making at the level of Senate and senior management. There is new legislation within the canton and compliance with this is taking a lot of resources. The university also plans to complete full integration by the end of 2014.

The university plans to use the Faculty of Information Technology as a pilot before extending the project to the other faculties. It is calculated that entry of data for the past three years will take approximately five months. A bug in the software is also hindering entry of additional data. The software does not summarise data from faculties to form the university picture and this must be entered separately. The company has made some adaptations to the software but more needs to be done.

Staff were trained on the use of the software over the summer months in 2013. Faculties are using different softwares at the moment to enter data into and this data will need to be transferred/imported into the software provided by SHEQA.

**Register of Study Programmes**

The relevant software is not yet installed on the university server. However there is a commitment to ensure that it is installed by the end of the week of 23 June 2013. A plan has been prepared, based on a pilot study of the resources needed to complete the entry of data into the software for development of a complete register of study programmes. The resources required are significant and there is uncertainty as to whether they can be made available in the short term. The moratorium on recruitment in the university adds to the difficulties, as well as the fact the university employs only two IT specialists at the moment.

All faculties have a register of their own study programmes but there is no university level register. Training on the use of the software was held in February 2013 and comments and recommendations for improvements were gathered. The representative of the university expressed uncertainty as to who should contact the company about rectifying bugs/adapting it to the needs of the university.

As of October 2013 the software has been installed on the server and approximately 14% of study programmes are now on the Register and work is ongoing to ensure all study programmes will be on the Register as soon as possible. The University continues to have difficulties in financing and human resource availability for such work but has appointed a dedicated team to lead on the work and expressed its commitment to the conclusion of the work during the academic year 2013/2014. Internal workshops and traning on the use of the software have taken place and the unviersity now has a project plan in place to ensure a successful conclusion to the work.

**Action plan**

The university has developed a clear action plan for full implementation and sustainability and presented this to the project consortium in October 2013.

**Recommendations made following June 2013 meeting**

1. The university should appoint a project management team to oversee and lead on the actions required for the full implementation of the project. ***Implemented***
2. The university should liaise with both the University of Mostar (project coordinator) and the software company, Optima, to work towards eliminating the bugs in the software that are hindering implementation and use of both the KPI and Register of study programmes software. ***Implemented***

**Annex 3**

**Report on site visit to University of Sarajevo**

**Introduction**

The visiting team was welcomed to the University by the Rector.

Following the meeting with the Rector a brief presentation was made on the University of Sarajevo and the context in which it operates. The team was introduced to the UTIC – a telecommunications hub operating in the university. It was confirmed that the university has its own infrastructure and was the first internet provider in BiH. It supports an information system with data on students, staff, library resources, etc. Examples of the types of reports generated, including graphical representation of the data were shown. This is still work in progress and it is hoped that the process of completing the development of an integrated information system will be completed within 6 months. The university has 23 faculties and 2 associate faculties.

**Key Performance indicators (KPIs)**

The university has looked at the SHEQA software and feels it looks good and usable. However it is not yet populated or being used in any way in the university. A meeting has taken place with some staff in June and it is hoped that the process will commence soon of entering the organisational structure of the university. Training of faculty administrators will commence in the autumn by the SHEQA coordinator within the university and UTIC.

The management of the university has not yet decided which KPIs will be collected and used by the university. It is anticipated that not all the SHEQA agreed indicators will be used, and also that some additional ones will be included. It is hoped to find a sustainable methodology whereby the internal information system can ‘talk’ to the SHEQA software. Work has not yet commenced on this.

**Register of Study Programmes**

The university is in the process of testing the software and has identified some issues of concern. The university needs to generate a list of those issues and to liaise with the University of Mostar and the software company to resolve these. It is probable that some of these have been solved elsewhere and that information may help the University of Sarajevo to proceed with the implementation.

**Dissemination**

There is a proposed plan to hold meetings in the autumn with staff to inform them of the project and its objectives with respect to KPIs and the Register of study programmes. The university expressed its commitment to the use and dissemination of the information generated to stakeholders, including the ministry and the wider public.

**Recommendations**

1. The University should liaise with colleagues in other universities who are further advanced in the implementation of the use of the software to address some of the issues identified as difficulties by the university.
2. The University should develop a list of issues to be resolved and send these to the University of Mostar for forwarding to the software company.

**Annex 4**

**Report on site visit to University of East Sarajevo**

**Introduction**

The visiting team was welcomed to the University by the Vice-Rector. A detailed report on the progress made on the implementation of the SHEQA project objectives was made in advance of the site visit.

The university has achieved full accreditation status from the HEA and is fully integrated..

A detailed and comprehensive presentation was made on the implementation and use of both softwares. The presentation included a contextual analysis of the background to the project and the steps taken by the university prior to the commencement of the project.

**Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)**

Since its beginning this project has brought focus on a new way of management of strategic objectives and action plans through KPIs and has given a new dimension to quality assurance within the University.

At the beginning of this project, the university was still collecting KPIs by developing self-evaluation reports of all the faculties and academies, and generating ​​a university report from this data. University KPIs were created by the Committee for Quality Assurance 3 years ago, with a division into 6 categories, and a total of 36 indicators to measure. Every year the university sends a self-evaluation report to the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Srpska along a report on the identified and measured KPIs. KPIs are also presented to the University Senate, Board of Directors and the Committee for Quality Assurance. Some indicators, such as those for finances and human resources, are limited directly by the ministry so that it is not possible to achieve the ideal values​​. Respectively, the budget and recruitment of new staff depend on the Republic of Srpska Government, but, there is also a noticeable increase in the University’s own revenues. Stimulus for research by the State is very small so it is not possible to advance in this field, except with the participation in European projects and European funding to stimulate research.

The university’s KPIs are the same as those identified and agreed in the SHEQA project.

**Register of Study Programmes**

The University has a registry of study programmes (curricula, syllabi, teaching staff), as well as all the faculties on its website with published curricula. Previously study programmes have never been located in one place in the electronic application within the university. This software application will enable information on all study programmes to be held in one place, and thus available to the general public. Future students will be able to search the entire database of study programmes available in the university and choose what suits them best.

The university plans to use the data gathered to reduce the costs of teaching and ensure that the budget is used to best possible advantage.

The university plans to have the Register completed on the SHEQA software by September 2013. There are some difficulties with double entry of data required and the need to have all fields completed (obligatory and optional) before the information is visible on the public web site. One of the key issues is the translation function of the software which does not seem to be operating as well as it should.

**Dissemination**

Since the beginning of the project, the Committee for Quality Assurance has been informed of the implementation of the activities, and has fully supported the project. Teachers, administrative staff and students have all been included from the outset.

Dissemination of KPIs at faculties was carried out in a way ensuring that everyone who participated in the preparation of the self-evaluation report for the faculty was aware of the KPIs. A large number of people participated in their developing and collecting.

Dissemination of Register of Study Programs was conducted at a seminar where representatives of all the faculties and students were present, and demonstrating the practical use of this software.

Once the software company has further developed the translation of Croatian into Serbian the register will be available on the university website.

**Follow-up**

All translation issues have now been solved by the company providing the software. The Register of Study Programmes is now available on the university web site and any outstanding information required will be entered by November 2013.

**Recommendation**

1. That optima provides access to the software to allow universities to adapt and amend software to suit individual requirements.

**Annex 5**

**Report on site visit to University of Zenica**

**Introduction**

The visiting team were welcomed to the University by the Vice-Rector for QA and International Cooperation. The Universiy has 6,000 students, approxiately 400 full-time employees and 200 guest professors. There are 10 organisational units and the univeristy is fully integrated.

A presentation was made to the visiting team on the progress and implementation to date of the objectives and activities of the Temps SHEQA project. It was evident that the University has an advanced strategic planning and management process in place for a number of years, well accepted by all members of the university and supported. The quality assurance systems, including the use of key performance indicators as a mechanism of monitoring performance, is sophisticated and well embedded. The university is integrated with a QA officer and ECTS manager in each of the 8 faculties/institutes – a model for other universities to follow.

The presentation by the University included a presentation on the strategic plan 2013-2017 with clear definition of the future direction of the university with regards to QA, implementation of the Bologna Process, informatics, financing, student experience, etc. For every indicator there is precise information provided as well as specific targets to be aimed towards. (The document will also be provided in English as soon as translation is completed (September 2013). Judgements are based on outcomes and analysis of surveys of students and staff, in addition to KPIs.

**Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)**

In the University of Zenica the use of key performance indicators has been an obligatory element of the annual self-evaluation report to senior management, the University Steering Board and the Senate. The University has installed the SHEQA software and has a minimum of 4 years of data on the system – collected and analysed. The semaphore system of indicating results against targets is proving very useful to the staff and Senate of the university as well as the histograms demonstrating the trends. All elements of the software are used within the university at faculty as well as senior management level.

Annual reports to Senate include very detailed analysis of KPIs drawn from the SHEQA software. The visiting team saw the report to Senate that had been presented that day by the Vice-Rector. It was extremely detailed and commended by the Senate as an excellent tool for the evidence-based decision-making process within the university. All categories of KPI are included in the analysis performed at university and faculty levels. New indicators are added every year as the process is increasing in sophistication – usually as a result of proposals from faculties and senior management. The outcomes and analysis of performance against these indicators and targets are used in the annual report of the Rector to the University Steering Board and Senate.

Almost all of the faculties have completed the entry of data into the software, allowing a detailed analysis of performance. Some faculties are still completing the process and the aim is for this process to be completed by September 2013. The faculties understand and appreciate the benefits of the system as an easier and more efficient way to collect and process performance data. It is uniform across the university allowing for easier comparisons and benchmarking, and providing relevant information for actioning of the strategic plan.

In relation to the use of the software the university now has considerable experience. Initially there were a number of difficulties but these have been overcome. The university has found the software to be very useful especially for internal evaluations and the results have fostered discussions within the university and also with the ministry on the costs and benefits of education.

**Register of Study Programmes**

Training of staff on the software for the Register of study programmes within the university has been conducted. Data has been entered, including all programmes in each faculty. Each course has been assigned a unique code ensuring double entry cannot occur.

Data has been entered for the past number of years including the accreditation status of each programme. Criteria have been defined for all study programmes within each faculty. Professorial appointments are all integrated so there is no confusion at inter-faculty level, and each professor and member of academic staff will be required to update the information on the Register with respect to personal information including research outputs.

The university has found the architecture to be correct and initial difficulties have all been overcome. All teaching methods, references, assessments, etc are defined and entered into the Register. All information (courses, human resources) are coded at university level. Public access to data has been provided.

**Dissemination**

Training has take place for every QA coordinator and ECTS coordinator in every faculty of the university. The information is all available on the university web site accessible by all members of the university and also the public. A centre for KPI management has been established. A full report has been prepared by the University.

**Action Plan for Sustainability**

All data has been presented to the Senate, benchmarking within the university has been organised and, in addition, with the University of East Sarajevo. The strategic plan for the next 4 years developed in May 2013, is based on KPIs. The information will continue to form the basis for the annual university and faculty/institute self-evaluation reports. The middle managment level in the university as well as senior management, fully recognise the benefits of the use of the KPI software and are full engaged with its use and both internal and external benchmarking.

**Annex 6**

**Report on site visit to University of Tuzla**

**Introduction**

The University has 16,000 students and 13 faculties, a QA office staffed with 5 members, a QA Board which is a policy making body with representatives of all faculties. The university is very advanced in development of its QA systems and is fully integrated with appropriate checks and balances in place for the collection and analysis of data. The university had an advanced information system developed prior to the commencement of the SHEQA project, with data on all services, human resources, student data, teaching facilities, etc. KPIs are reported on annually to the University Steering Board and Senate.

**Key Performance indicators (KPIs)**

The university has installed and has populated in full the KPI software. The visiting team saw a detailed and very comprehensive demonstration of the software, its data and analytical capability, and was very impressed with the progress to date and the approach of the university to solving difficulties as they arose. The university expressed its satisfaction with the company developing and supplying the software and found it to be very responsive to queries and suggestions for improvement. Some of these have led to upgrades of the software which have been made available to all partners in the project.

**Register of study programmes**

The software has been installed and populated within the university. Staff will be required to update information on a regular basis. The register is not yet publicly available because of a technical problem with the University web site which it hoped to correct by mid-July. The University is very satisfied with the outcomes of this project and welcomes the facility it provides for improved strategic management and monitoring, together with better-informed decision-making.

**Dissemination**

The university has disseminated information on the project very widely internally within the university. As soon as the technical difficulties with the web site have been addressed the pubic will be informed and encouraged to view the Register. The university will also provide a link to the HEA and to the ministry so that those organisations can also publish the information.

**Follow-up**

The data on study programmes is now available on the university web site and the link has been sent to the HEA. The university has added some additional KPIs that it feels are particularly useful to it in its plannign for development and overall expressed its satisfaction with the tools provided by the project.

**Action Plan**

The University’s strategic management is based on the use of the data and analysis delivered by this project and the software provided. It is fully expected that the university will continue to use the software as a means to generate appropriate reports and to disseminate information on study programmes to the public.

**Annex 7**

**Report on site visit to University of Banja Luka**

**Introduction**

The visiting team was welcomed by the Vice Rector for Quality Assurance and international Relations. The agenda for the visit was discussed and agreed prior to the commencement of the demonstration of the software and its use.

The university is fully integrated and operates as a single unified entity. A presentation was made on the structures relating to Quality Assurance and relationships to the managing board and senate. Plans are well underway for the completion of the development of a fully integrated information system for the university which is deemed essential by the University for strategic planning, quality assurance and monitoring of implementation of strategic objectives and gaols.

A committee has been established within the university to oversee the implementation of all quality assurance objectives, including those of the SHEQA project. The committee has members drawn from faculties and is chaired by the Vice-Rector.

Each faculty has identified a quality assurance officer and these officers are working together on quality assurance and its implementation, including that of the SHEA project. The University has approved sets of detailed guidelines and procedures for quality assurance, including a range of forms for collection of monitoring data, and comprehensive guidelines for the design and improvement of study programmes. Mapping the university quality indicators (many in place prior to the commencement of the SHEQA project) to the SHEQA KPIs agreed is taking place. Additional indicators are also used at university level.

**Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)**

The University made a detailed presentation on the KPIs being monitored and the trends displayed over the past three years. The demonstration was very comprehensive and clearly provided evidence of the significant amount of work done to date. The full range of indicators are being monitored and used comprehensively. The university is analysing trends and identifying reasons for trends, whether positive or negative.

The university identified one issue with the software and that related to the translation function. The university is entering data in Serbian and there is a very comprehensive set of data across all the range of indicators as was demonstrated. However when the data is translated into English, for example, it is found that much of the data has to be re-entered and re-saved. It is not transferring across into the English language version of the software. Thus this means double entry is necessary, with the accompanying additional workload and risk of errors being made. This is a serious bug which will need to be corrected by the software company. There should not be any difference in the information provided by the Serbian and English versions of the software. It is also possible that this problem applies to the translation of Croatian and Bosnian as well.

Some data is managed at university level and some at faculty level allowing for flexible use of the data, as relevant. There is a need to complete entry of some data at the faculty level and work is ongoing to address this.

At the moment some data is still entered manually but in the future, once the development of the integrated information system is completed, it is planned that all data will be uploaded into the SHEQA software electronically. This will remove any possibility of errors and reduce the workload involved. Data on academic workload still needs to be uploaded and is being confirmed at the present and will be uploaded from excel files. In a few instances the limitation on the number of pints after a decimal point allowed by the software is limiting and the university would wish to see this changed. It is also possible that some indicators need to be redefined e.g. no of internet access points, % of campus covered by wifi access, etc.

**Register of Study Programmes**

The University is in the process of building its own internal database of all study programmes and their details and examples from this were shown to the visiting team. Once this exercise is complete, it is planned to upload this information directly into the SHEQA software, send the link to the HEA and the ministry for putting on the relevant web sites.

**Follow-up**

All translation issues are now resolved by the company. The university has completed its Register of its Study Programmes and has made it pubicly available on the university web site and has sent the link to the HEA.

**Dissemination**

All staff have been informed of the strategic planning, monitoring and data collection activities of the university. All are required to participate and engage in these exercises. At this stage strategic monitoring is well embedded at all levels in the university. The university is committed to ensuring that the procedures and policies in place are all working in practice at the appropriate levels, and is continuing to embed all processes more deeply. Work has commenced with the most committed senior management leaders (including deans and professors) and faculties and will continue to engage with all staff to improve the quality of all activities in the university.

**Action Plan for Sustainability**

It is planned to have the work on the database of study programme information completed by 1 September and then to upload all data to the SHEQA software. It is anticipated that all work will be completed by the end of October 2013. From then on the data and information will be collected annually to allow for continuous monitoring and reporting to the university management team and the Senate, allowing for evidence-based decision-making.

**Ministry of Education and Culture in Republic of Srpska**

Two representatives of the ministry attended the entire meeting with the University of Banja Luka representatives and presentations. They expressed their keen interest in the outcomes of the project and their commitment to doing whatever is appropriate to assist the University (and all HEIs within the Republic) in achieving its objectives. The ministry is committed to publishing the link to the Register of study programmes as soon as it is available for all institutions for which it has responsibility. The representatives were impressed by the demonstration of the use of the KPI software and its capacity to assist the university in planning and monitoring and quality assurance and wished the university every success.

**Recommendation:** that the university relay the information on the translation issues to the University of Mostar, as the coordinators of the project in BiH, and request that the company that supplied the software be requested to correct this. ***Implemented.***

**Annex 8**

**Report on site visit to HEA**

The visiting team was welcomed to the premises of the HEA by the Deputy Director, Mr. Velimir Jukic. Following a brief overview of the objectives of the SHEQA project, a brief presentation was made on the current state of the HEA web site and the data available to the HEA.

**Register of Study Programmes**

The value to society, including in particular potential learners, parents, secondary schools, employers and other stakeholders, in the central role that the Agency could and should, as a national agency, play was re-iterated. The importance to all stakeholders of easy access to accurate data on study programmes offered by all Higher Education Institutions in BiH was stressed.

Some discussion also took place on the issue of the study programme offerings by private universities and colleges in BiH. In all there are 45 HEIs – 10 public (8 universities and 2 colleges) and 35 privately owned and managed private institutions. The scope of the SHEQA project covers only the 8 public universities but the HEA has to consider also the other 2 public and the 35 private institutions.

The HEA confirmed that links to the Register of Study Programmes in 4 of the 8 public universities in BiH (University of Banja Luka, University of Zenica, University of East Sarajevo, University of Sarajevo) had been received and it is awaiting the links to the remaining universities’ registers. The importance of making these links, and others as they become available, accessible to the public easily and the central role an agency, in this case the HEA, has in facilitating this was emphasised. From all points of view the advantages to the public, and in particular potential students, in the provision of this information available in one location was stressed. This is a vital role for any national agency for QA in higher education and the HEA confirmed its awareness of this and its willingness to provide this service to the public in BiH.

The HEA confirmed that it has plans for the updating of the web site so as to include in a central position on the home page links to

* Accredited HEIs (public and private)
* The status of the accreditation process for institutions who have applied for accreditation but where the process is not yet concluded.
* Register of Study programmes.

The target date for completion of this work on the web site is 20 July 2013. The HEA is aware that not all universities may have completed their registers by that time. However the HEA plans to proceed with the information available to it and will add new information as it becomes available over the next few months.

**Follow-Up**

The Agency has published links to the Registers of Study Programmes on its web site. This is not yet well advertised and the Agency wishes to continue its work on enhancing the quality assurance of higher edcuation in BiH public institutions.

**Dissemination**

The HEA plans to commence a series of dissemination activities throughout BiH following the conclusion of the project on the upgrading of the web site to accommodate the information on accreditation status of HEIs and the Register of Study programmes. The HEA considers this to be a work in progress that is important not to wait for all information to become available for actions to take place. The possibility of this dissemination activity at the final conference for the project in October 2013 was discussed and considered it would be a very appropriate target. This timing would also allow universities time to finalise the work on their registers of their study programmes so that it would be hoped that all partners in the consortium would have information accessible from their own web pages and also the HEA web page.

**Annex 9**

**Report on site visit to University of Bihac**

**Introduction**

The visiting team were welcomed to the University at the rectorate. It was confirmed that the university is an integrated one since 2010 and that a quality assurance rule book has been adopted by the university council in 2008. There are seven faculties, each holding relevant information on students. There is a need to integrate the information from these faculties.

**Key Performance Indicators and Register of Study programmes**

The University of Bihac has not yet purchased servers to put the relevant project software on. Thus no work has yet commenced on the implementation of the project objectives either in relation to key performance indicators or the register of study programmes.

The University confirmed it has received the latest upgrades to the software and had held a meeting with some staff to explain the background. The university stated it is planning an information day sometime in the autumn for staff on the project goals and supports provided to enable the university to achieve these.

The timelines to the end of the project were given to the university. The university does not have a specific action plan as yet, pending the acquisition of the necessary servers.

**Recommendation**: that the University commences actions to acquire and install the SHEQA software immediately and that the work on population of the software with relevant data begins as soon as possible thereafter.

**Follow-Up**

At the October meeting the university confirmed that a server has been provided for the project tools. The software has been installed and training sessions on its use have been organized at each faculty. Practical issues have been discussed with staff. Each faculty in the university has its own Information system and has commenced collection and insertion of data onto the server. The university has a development plan which includes the conclusion of the work still to be done on data entry.